American Journal of Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics

Evaluation form for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

Instructions: Please mark your response with an "X" and use a red font to enter your response to each question.

OVERALL

Do you feel that the topic will be of interest to the readership?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Is there sufficient information to warrant further consideration/publication?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Additional Comments: >			

ABSTRACT

A. Does the abstract describe the following sections adequately?			
Study purpose	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Materials and methods	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Results	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Conclusions	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Additional Comments: >			

RESEARCH QUESTION

B. What is the specific question being asked? Complete this in PICO format, if possible.
Population and problem: >
Intervention or treatment: >
Control or comparison group: >
Outcomes measured: >
Additional Comments: >

Other SR or MA

C. Are there similar published SR or MA on this topic?	__Yes	__No	
If yes, list the reviews here, commenting on similarities or differences: >			

SEARCH

D. Which databases were searched?	__Pubmed	__Cochrane	__Embase
__Google Scholar	__Lilacs	__Web of Science	__Gray literature
__Hand search of reference lists	__Hand search of journal indices	Others:	

E-1. Was the search adequate?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
E-2. Was the search strategy for at least 1 database described in detail?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
E-3. Were the dates of the search defined?	__Yes	__No	
E-4. Were there restrictions on language? (If so, please specify)	__Yes	__No	__Partially
Additional comments regarding search methods: >			

STUDY SELECTION

F-1. Were inclusion/exclusion criterion clearly specified?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
F-2. Were papers selected by at least 2 independent reviewers?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
F-3. How were disagreements resolved?			
F-4. Was an accurate flow diagram provided?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

F-5. What kind of studies were included?
  __RCT   __Cohort   __Case/Control
  __Case series __Case reports __Cross-sectional			

F-6. Were excluded studies listed, with reasons?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

Additional comments regarding selection of studies: >

DATA ABSTRACTION

G-1. Was a custom form created and pilot tested?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
G-2. Did the authors list the data abstracted from the papers?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
G-3. Were there at least 2 independent data abstractors?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

G-4. How were disagreements resolved? >
Additional comments regarding data abstraction: >

ASSESSMENT of STUDIES

H-1. Was an assessment of bias performed?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

H-2. If so, which tool or scale was used? >

H-3. Was use of this tool or scale appropriate?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
H-4. Was risk of bias/quality assessment undertaken correctly?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

Additional comments regarding bias assessment: >

DATA SYNTHESIS

I-1. Were summary outcomes specified?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
I-2. Were meta-analyses justified and performed properly?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
I-3. Was clinical and statistical heterogeneity addressed?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
I-4. Were sensitivity analyses performed and justified?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

Additional comments regarding data synthesis: >

RESULTS

J-1. Summary table with characteristics of included studies presented?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
J-2. Summary data from meta analyses reported?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
J-3. Results appear to be drawn accurately from evidence gathered?	__Yes	__No	__Partially

Additional comments regarding results: >

DISCUSSION

K-1. Implications for practice? >
K-2. Implications for future research? >
K-3. Limitations of this SR or MA? >
Additional comments regarding discussion: >

CONCLUSIONS and MISCELLANEOUS

L-1. Are conclusions appropriate and based on evidence?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
L-2. Is this SR a contribution to the orthodontic literature?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
L-3. Is the abstract an accurate synopsis of the SR or MA?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
L-4. Were conflicts of interest and funding disclosed?	__Yes	__No	__Partially
L-5. Was this SR or MA registered?	__Yes	__No	
L-6. Are the writing style and grammar acceptable?	__Yes	__No	

Additional comments regarding conclusions and miscellaneous items: >

Any final or overall comments regarding this submission? >

Final Recommendation:

__Reject	__Major revision	__Minor revision	__Accept after copy editing